

CHARGE PUMP AND ELECTRIC MOTOR DRIVER TECHNICAL QUOTATION SUMMARY --PRELIMINARY

EVALUATION ITEM	RFQ REQUIREMENT	BIDDER A	BIDDER B	BIDDER C	BIDDER D	BIDDER E	BIDDER F
GENERAL							
BIDDERS REFERENCE NUMBER	ADVISE	7H 3134	C97066	N7-CA1688	CPO 12599	SO098877	LAZ 6587
BID RECEIVED DATE	BID CLOSING: DEC 23	23-Dec-10	23-Dec-10	23-Dec-10	23-Dec-10	23-Dec-10	2 JAN 2011 (NOTE 1)
DELIVERY (incl all test) (WK incl ship)	NEED 40 wks	35	40	30	45	55 (NOTE 2)	39
PUMP TYPE	BBS	BB 2	BB 5	N/A (NOTE 6)	BB 5	BB 5	BB 5
PUMP RATED SPEED (RPM)	ADVISE	1200	3550 (NOTE 20)	400	3590	3550	1800
WGT ESTIMATE INCL DRIVER (kg)	ADVISE	5000	10000	5000	8000	13,000	NO DATA (NOTE 14)
DIMS PKG (LxWxH)(INCL DRIVER)(m)	ADVISE	2.5 X 4 X 3.5	3X4X3.5	2.5 X 2 X 3	2X4X3.5	3.5 X 4.5 X 3.5	NO DATA (NOTE 14)
REFERENCE LIST SATISFACTORY FOR PUMP	REQUIRED	NOTE 4	NOTE 9	YES	YES	YES	NO DATA
BASEPLATE SUPPORTS THE >	DRIVER & PUMP	DRIVER & PUMP	PUMP (NOTE 18)	DRIVER & PUMP	DRIVER & PUMP	DRIVER & PUMP	DRIVER & PUMP
NUMBER OF IMPELLERS	ADVISE	1	1	PISTON PUMP	2	7	6
SUCTION SPECIFIC SPEED (CUSTOMARY UNITS)	<= 12000	11900	NO DATA	N/A PISTON PUMP	11900	11100	12975
LUBRICATION (PUMP BEARINGS)	OIL	OIL RING	NO DATA (NOTE 21)	NO DATA	OIL RING	OIL RING	OIL RING
PROCESS DATA							
PROPOSAL CURVE NUMBER	ADVISE	CC12345	CRV 45879	NO DATA	CPO 5647	BBI 12345	SP 321
FLOW RATED (m3/hr)	500	500	PARTIAL (NOTE 5)	500	500	500	500
HEAD RATED (m)	700	700	700	700	700	700	700
HYDRAULIC POWER (Kw)	540	540	540	540	540	540	540
HYDRAULIC EFFIC. AT NORMAL POINT (%)	ADVISE	75	71	88	76	88	81
RATED POWER (KW)	ADVISE	720	837	614	711	614	667
NPSHA (m)	11	11	11	11	11	11	11
NPSH R (m)	10	9	8	10 (NOTE 26)	9	10	8
LOCATION OF RATED POINT ON PUMP CURVE	PER API 610	OK	NOTE 22	N/A	GOOD	VERY GOOD	GOOD
PIPING DATA							
FLANGE SIZES (SUCTION / DISCHARGE)	ADVISE	10 X 8	8 x 6	6 x 4	8 X 6	12 X 10	8 X 6
FLANGE ORIENTATION (SUCTION / DISCHARGE)	UPI/UP	UPI/UP	UPI/UP	UP / DN	UPI/UP	UP / UP	UPI/UP
MATERIALS							
CASING MATERIALS	S6	S6	NO DATA	NODULAR C IRON	S6	S6 UPGRADED	S 6
SHAFT END SEALS							
SEAL CODE	11/ 52	11 / 52	11 / 52	N/A	EXCLUDED USED \$ FROM BIDDER B	11 /52 WINTERIZED	11 /52
INDUCTION MOTOR DRIVER							
MANUFACTURER	ADVISE	RELIABLE MOTOR INC	WIERDO MOTOR CO (NOTE 3)	VARIOUS (NOTE 12)	VALUE MOTOR INC	SUPREME MOTOR INC	NO DATA NOTE 14
NAMEPLATE POWER (Kw / hp)	ADVISE	932 / 1250	1300 / 2345 (NOTE 23)	756 / 1000	932 / 1250	756 / 1000 (NOTE 17)	756 / 1000
MOTOR SPEED:(RATED) RPM	ADVISE	1200	3550	1200	3560	3550	3600
OTHER SCOPE ITEMS							
COUPLING	FLEX ELEMENT DRY	FLEX ELEMENT DRY	NO DATA	NO DATA	NO DATA	INCLUDED	NO DATA
CONTROL PANEL	FREESTANDING	INCLUDED	NO DATA	INCL (NOTE 13)	INCL (NOTE 15)	INCL	INCL
PERFORMANCE TEST	REQUIRED	NOT OFFERED (NOTE 8)	HAVE ADDER	N/A (NOTE 16)	INCL	INCL	INCL
COMPLIANCE WITH RFQ - UNEVALUATED							
ENGINEERING NOTES	REQUIRED	GOOD	NOTE 24	NOT APPLIC (NOTE 6)	PARTIAL	APPEARS GOOD	PARTIAL
DATA SHEETS	REQUIRED	GOOD	NOTE 24	NOT APPLIC (NOTE 6)	NO DATA	APPEARS GOOD	NO DATA
COMPLIANCE WITH NARRATIVE SPECIFICATIONS	REQUIRED	APPEARS REASONABLE	NO DATA	NOT APPLIC (NOTE 6)	POOR	APPEARS GOOD	NO DATA
QUALITY REQUIREMENTS	REQUIRED	APPEARS REASONABLE	NO DATA	PARTIAL	"VENDOR STANDARD"	APPEARS GOOD	NO DATA
DRAWING AND DOCUMENTATION	REQUIRED	APPEARS REASONABLE	NOTE 25	NOT APPLIC (NOTE 6)	"VENDOR STANDARD"	APPEARS GOOD	PARTIAL DATA
TECHNICALLY ACCEPTABLE PRELIMINARY SHORTLIST FOR FULL EVALUATION?	PRELIMINARY FOR S/LIST	N	YES (NOTE 16)		Y	NOTE 11	N
		N	Y		Y	Y	N
UNEVALUATED PRICING FOR REF ONLY							
BASE PRICE EACH PUMP, DRIVER, AND SKID		\$190,000	\$225,000	\$180,000	\$205,000	\$385,000	\$375,000
DRIVER (INCL TESTS)		\$25,000	\$20,000	\$25,000	\$25,000	\$37,000	NOT CLEAR
SEAL SYSTEM (USED INHOUSE EST FOR BIDDER D)	INCLUDED IN BASE PRICE		\$17,000	INCL IN BASE PRICE	\$12,000	\$20,000	NOT CLEAR
CONTROL PANEL (MAIN) and SEAL PANEL		\$50,000	\$45,000	INCL IN BASE PRICE	INCL IN BASE PRICE	INCL IN BASE PRICE	NOT CLEAR
PERFORMANCE TEST		\$10,000	\$10,000	\$8,000	INCL IN BASE PRICE	INCL IN BASE PRICE	NOT CLEAR
SPARE PUMP ROTOR W/TEST	INCLUDED IN BASE PRICE		\$18,000	\$17,000	INCL IN BASE PRICE	\$22,000	NOT CLEAR
COST OF EXTRA ENG HOURS TO EXPEDITE	100 hrs @ \$85 /hr	\$0	\$8,500	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0
COST OF POWER DIFFERENTIAL		LATER (NOTE 7)	\$0	\$0	INCL IN BASE PRICE	\$0	\$0
TOTAL UNEVALUATED PRICE (CDNS)		\$275,000	\$343,500	\$230,000	\$242,000	\$464,000	\$375,000

NOTES

- Bid closing was 23 Dec 2010; This bid arrived on Jan 2, 2011. The Bid consists of 7 pages of data only - The bid recommendation is due Jan 15,2011
- Vendor advised on Jan 1 that shipping from Europe has not been included in delivery; Bidder has been requested to review delivery
- INFO: There was no recommended driver bidderlist in the RFQ
- Bidder's proposal is a 1 stage pump with 30" diameter impeller; bidder has not manufactured impellers this big before.
Your client technical person says she has many of his manufacturers pumps on site and is confident of the Bidders ability to build this pump
- Bidder's data sheets show 2 different flows - 485 m3/hr and 523 m3/hr. Bidder has promised to clarify this soon
- Bidder has offered 2 piston pumps only. This was not requested. He did not offer a base bid of a centrifugal pump
There is no offer a base bid for a centrifugal pump The piston pump option was never considered when making the RFQ
- No data available from the project; power cost & evaluation time was requested - this has not been provided yet.
- Bid states that a mech run test only is offered; Adder for performance test has been requested, not yet received.
Used an inhouse estimate for bidder A test price to equalize bids
- Bidder advised that the list is in the mail. On another project this vendor has been 2 months late with document submittals, needed continuous expediting so an estimate of extra expediting / engineering time has been added to the bid
- Cost of equivalent test for recip has been requested - should this have been done ?
- The EPC buyer wants to discontinue evaluation of this Bidder due to high price; buyer says "this bidder is way out in left field"
- Bidder offered technical data from 4 different Motor vendors for us to evaluate and select.
- Bidder offered 3 control panel bids for us to evaluate; no time to evaluate these yet - use the mid price for equalization
- Bidder has promised this data in 2 weeks. Engineer & Buyer want to stop evaluation of this Bidder as schedule is tight & he has been slow to reply to questions
- Bidder has included in bid a combined main control panel & seal panel mounted on end of pump skid for an estimated savings of \$20,000
- Pending receipt of clear process data
- Vendor asked during bid process if power cost was important - someone told him yes so he bid an expensive very efficient pump and motor
- Bidder states he prefers to have the motor shipped on a separate skid. Not clear as to why. Not equalized but will not affect the evaluation decision
- Deleted
- Bid Data sheets show 3000 RPM, curve shows 3550 RPM
- Bidder has said that a pressure lube system will be included if needed after bearing design is complete
- No curves in bid - promised in 1 week
- Rated power is correct - motor rating appears too large
- Bidder has stated he is in general Compliance with these specifications
- Bidder has stated he will provide drawings as soon as engineering is done
- Not clear if this includes acceleration head